





14. Indian Logic as preserved in Tibet.

By Mahāmahopādhyāya Satis Chandra Vidyābhūşaņa, M.A., M.R.A.S.

On an examination of some volumes of the Tibetan Block Prints brought down to Calcutta by the late Tibet Mission, and of two volumes of the Hodgson collection, graciously lent to me by Mr. F. W. Thomas of the India Office, London, I have come across twenty-five Indian Buddhist works on Logic in faithful Tibetan translations. The following pages give a short account of these twenty-five works that were composed in India between 400-1200 A.D. With the exception of Nos. 11 and 13, the Sanskrit originals of which were, under unique circumstances, discovered among the palm-leaf manuscripts preserved in the Jain temple of Sāntināth, Cambay, these works are no longer available in India or Nepal and were probably destroyed on the decline of Buddhism here. But they have been careon the decline of Buddhism here. fully preserved in Tibet in literal translations. These translations, of which I have appended a brief notice, are most valuable, as they will throw a flood of light on the development of Logic in India and will serve as connecting links between the ancient Nyāya of Gotama about 500 B.C. and the modern Nyāya of Gangeśa Upādhyāya in 1400 A.D. They, moreover, show that Logic was cultivated not in Mithilā and Nadia alone, but also as far as in Kāśmīra in the north, in Andhra in the south and Nālandā in Madhyadeśa.

1. Pramāṇa-samuccaya ¹ (Tibetan: Tshad-ma-kun-laṣ-btuṣ-pa, meaning "a collection of proofs" in verse) by Dignāga (Tib.:

Phyogs-kyi-glan-po).

The work which consists of 13 leaves (leaf 1—13) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, begins with an invocation to Buddha and is divided into six chapters which are named, respectively, as follows:—(1) pratyakṣa, Tib.: mnon-sum, or sense-perception; (2) svārthānumāna, Tib.: ran-don-gyi-rje-dpag, or inference for one's own self; (3) parārthānumāna, Tib.: gshan-gyi-don-gyi-rje-dpag, or inference for the sake of others; (4) tri-rūpa-hetu, Tib.: tshul-sum-gtan-tshigs, or three phases of the middle term, and upamāna-khaṇḍana, Tib.: dpe-dan-dpe-ltar-snan-pa, or "comparison, that is, recognition of a thing from the perception of a similar thing, is no separate proof"; (5) śabdānumāna-nirāsa, Tib.: sgra-rje-dpag-min, that is, "word or testimony is no separate proof"; and (6) nyāyāvayava, Tib.: rigs-pahi-yan-lag, or parts of a syllogism.

¹ Probably the same as "The Sastra on the grouped inferences." Vide I-tsing edited by Takakusu p. 187.

Dignāga, who compiled this work named samuccaya, is described in the concluding lines to be the vanquisher of opponents in

all quarters and to be as strong as an elephant.1

The work was translated into Tibetan by an Indian sage named Svarnāyudha, Tib.: Gser-gyi-go-cha, of the monastery of Seg-pahidge-gnas (place of knowledge and virtue) and a Tibetan interpret-

er named Dad-pahi-ses-rab (of faithful wisdom).

2. Pramāṇa-samuccaya-vṛtti (Tib.: Tshad-ma-kun-las-btus pahi-hgrel-wa)—a commentary in prose on work No. 1 by Dignāga himself. It extends over 83 leaves (leaf 13—96) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, and is divided into six chapters corresponding to those of the original text. Led on by the command of Mañjunātha (the god of learning) Dignāga, the great disputant of sharp intellect, wrote this commentary. His śāstra is as deep as the ocean.

The commentary was translated into Tibetan, at the command of the king Rigs-ldan-rgyal-po, by the famous Indian sage Vasudhara-raksita, who was, as it were, the crest-gem of logicians,

and the Tibetan interpreter Sha-ma-dge-bsñen-sen-rgyal.3

द्वेचिश.ग्री.मिट.ग्रुप्.चीचट.ग्रेप्श.चर्थात। ट्रुप्तश.चर-ग्रुप्त.मीट.ग्रुप्,श्रुपश.ज्या। ब्रुप्तश.चर्थातीय.ग्रु.मुज्यःचर्था।

(Tangyur, mdo, ce, leaf 13).

पद्शः मी. अष्ट्र्यः चत्रः अपूर्वः तृ ।।

प्रमान्त्रः स्त्रः अपूर्वः तृ देः न्यायः नश्चीयः द्युं नायः मीटः तृ दे नश्चयः पद्शः सह्राः सहराः सह्राः सहराः सहर

(Tangyur, mdo, ce, leaf 96).

यश्चिरः द्वाराक्षां स्वार्थः स्वर्थः स्वार्थः स्वार्थः स्वार्थः स्वार्थः स्वार्थः स्वार्थः स्वार्थः स्वर्थः स्वार्थः स्वार्थः स्वर्थः स्वर्यः स्वर्थः स्वर्थः स्वर्यः स्वर्यः स्वर्थः स्वर्थः स्वर्यः स्व

(Tangyur, mdo, ce, leaf 96).

Vol. III, No. 2.] Indian Logic as preserved in Tibet.
[N.S.]

3. Pramāna-samuccaya-vrtti (Tib.: Tshad-ma-kun-laṣ-btuṣ-paḥi-hgrel-wa)—a commentary in prose on No. 1 by Dignāga himself. It seems that the Sanskrit originals of Nos. 2 and 3 were identical though the Tibetan versions are different. It extends over 84 leaves of the Tangyur, mdo, ce (leaf 96—180) and begins with an invocation to Buddha. At the end of the 6th chapter it is stated that the commentary was translated into Tibetan by the Indian sage Svarṇāyudha, Tib: Gser-gyi-go-cha (in the monastery of Si-waḥi-dge-gnas) and the Tibetan interpreter Dad-pa-śeṣrab.

4. Višālāmalavatī-nāma-pramāṇa-samuccaya-tikā (Tib.: Yaṅs pa-daṅ-dri-ma-med-pa-daṅ-ldan-pa-sheṣ-bya-waḥi-tshad-ma-kun-laṣ-btuṣ-paḥi-hgrel-bśad)—a comprehensive commentary in prose on No. 1 by Jinendrabodhi (Tib: Rgyal-dwaṅ-blo-groṣ). It extends over 359 leaves of the Tangyur constituting the volume reof section mdo. It begins with an invocation to Buddha and ends with stating that Jinendrabodhi, the commentator, was a venerable countryman of the Bodhisattva. The commentary was translated into Tibetan by the Tibetan interpreter Rdo-rje-rgyal-mtshan with the assistance of the interpreter Dge-slon-dpal-idan-blo-gros.

5. Nyāya-pravešo-nāma-pramāna-prakaraņa¹ (Tib.: Tshadma-rigs-par-hjug-pahi-sgo-shes-bya-wahi-rab-tu-byed-pa)—a treatise on proofs in verse named "an entrance to logic" by Dignāga. It extends over five leaves of the Tangyur, mdo, ce (leaf 183—188), and begins with an invocation to Mañju-śri-kumāra-bhta. It was translated into Tibetan by the great Kāšmīrian Paṇdita Sarvajña-śri-rakṣita (Tib.: Thamṣ-cad-mkhyen-dpal-bzan, in the great Samuous Sākya Bhikṣu Rgyal-mtshan-dpal-bzan, in the great Sa-

skya monastery.

6. Pramāṇa-sāstra-pravesa (Chinese: Ga-yen-miṅ-gshaḥ-cin-liḥi-lun, Tib.: Tshaḍ-maḥi-bɜtan-bcoṣ-rig-pa-la-hjug-pa)—" an entrance to the science of proofs" in verse by Dignāga. It consists of five leaves (leaf I88—193) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, and begins with an invocation to Mañju-ghoṣa. The original text, which had been written in Sanskrit verse by Dignāga, was translated into Chinese by the Chinese interpreter Tha-sam-tsan. The Chinese version was translated into Tibetan by the Chinese scholar Dge-seṣ-sin-gyan and the Tibetan monk ston-gshon, in the Sa-skya monastery.

7. Hetu-cakra-hamaru ² (Tib: Gtan-tshigs-kyi-hkhor-logtan-la-dwab-pa)—"establishment of the wheel of reasons" in verse by Dignāga. It consists of only one leaf of the Tangyur, ando, ce (leaf 193—194) and begins with an invocation to Manju-śri-kumārabhūta, as well as to the Omniscient Buddha, the destroyer of the net of errors. The subject of the treatise is the

² Probably the same as Prajūapti-hetu-samgraha šāstra. Vide I-tsing, edited by Takakusu, p. 187.

¹ Probably the same as Nyāya-dvāra-śāstra (Bunyiu Nanjio, Nos. 1223, 1224). Vide I-tsing, edited by Takakusu, p. 186.

ninefold relation that exists between the middle termand the majorterm. It was translated into Tibetan by the sage Bodhisattva of

Za-hor and the Bhikşu Dharmāśoka.

8. Pramāṇa-vārtika-kārikā (Tib.: Tshad-ma-ṛnam-hgrel-gyitshig)—"memorial verses on the explanation of proofs," by Dharmakirti. It extends over 64 leaves (194b—258b) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, and begins with an invocation to Mañju-śrikumārabhūta. The four chapters, into which the work is divided, are styled as follows:—(1) svārthānumāna, Tib.: raṅ-gi-don-rjes-su-dpag-pa, or inference for one's own self; (2) pramāṇa-siddhi, Tib.: tshad-ma-grub-pa, or establishment of proofs; (3) pratyakṣa, Tib.: mnon-sum, or sense-perception; and (4) parār-thānumāna, Tib: gshan-gyig-don-gyi-tshig, or words for the sake of others. The work concludes by stating that it was written by the great sage Sri-Dharmakirti who was unrivalled and whose-fame and renown filled the earth. It was translated into Tibetan by the Indian sage Subhūti-śrī-śānti and the Tibetan interpreter-Dge-waḥī-blo-gros.

9. Pramānavārtika-vṛtti (Tib.: Tshad-ma-ruam-hgrel-gyi-hgrel-wa)—an explanatory commentary on Pramāṇa-vārtika (No. 8) by Dharmakirti. It extends over 115 leaves (leaf 420—535) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, and begins with an invocation to the Omniscient Buddha. In the concluding lines 3 Dharmakirti is described as a great teacher and dialectician, whose fame filled all quarters and on the earth who was, as it were, a lion pressing

down the head of elephant-like debaters.

10. Pramōna-viniścaya (Tib.: Tshad-ma-rnam-par-nes-pa)
— "determination of proofs" by Dharmakīrti. It extends over
88 leaves (leaf 259—347) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, and begins
with an invocation to Mañju-śrī-kumārabhūta. The three chapters into which it is divided are named respectively as follows:—
(1) Pratyakṣa-sthāpana, Tib.: mion-sum-gtan-la-dwab-pa, or

¹ Dharmakirti is further described in the concluding lines of the Pramāņavārtikakārikā to have been born in Yul-lho-phyogs, or Southern India.

हैं कुर यदे नामहायह सदे होता सामहित्य । देनाह हैं कि स्वाप्त के कि स्वाप्त के स्वाप्त क

त्राक्षर्रात्राक्ष्यं प्रत्राक्ष्यं स्वाधाः स्वधाः स्वधाः स्वधाः स्

Vol. III, No. 2.] Indian Logic as preserved in Tibet.
[N.S.]

establishment of sense-perception; (2) svārthānumāna, Tib.: rangi-don-gyi-rjes-su-dpag-pa, or inference for one's own self; and (3) parārthā-numāna, Tib: gshan-gyi-don-gyi-rjes-su-dpag-pa, or inference for the sake of others. In the concluding lines Dharmakīrti is described as a great sage of unrivalled fame. The work was translated into Tibetan by the Kāśmīrian Pandita Parahitabhadra (Tib: Gshan-la-phan-pa-bzan-po) and the Tibetan interpreter Blo-ldan-śes-rab in the matchless city of Kāśmīra.

11. Nyāyubindu-nāma-prakarana (Tib.: Rigs-pahi-thigs-pashes-bya-wahi-rab-tu-byed-pa)—" a treatise named a drop of logic" by Dharmakīrti. It consists of eight leaves (leaf 347—355) of the Tangyur, mdo, she, and begins with an invocation to Mañju-śrī-kumārabhūta. The three chapters into which it is divided are named, respectively, as follows:—(1) pratyakśa, Tib.: mānon-sum, or sense-perception; (2) svārthānumāna, Tib.: hdaggi-don-gyi rjes-su-dpag-pa, or inference for one's own self; and (3) parārthānumāna, Tib.: gshan-gyi-don-rjes-su-dpag-pa, or inference for the sake of others. In the concluding lines it is stated that "Dharmakīrti vanquished the Tirthikas without exception in the manner as Sākyamuni had subdued the large army of Māra; and as the sun dispels darkness, the Nyāyabindu has exterminated the Ātmaka theory (that is, the Tirthika doctrine)—Wonderful!"

12. Nyōyabindu-tikā (Tib.: Rigs-pahi thigs-pa-rgya-cherhgrel-wa)—"a detailed explanation of Nyāyabindu (No. 11)" by Vinītadeva (Tib.: Dul-wahi lha). It extends over 43 leaves (leaf 1—43a) of the Tangyur, mdo, she, and begins with an invocation to Manju-śri-kumārabhūta. The work was translated into

The reading \(\square\) in the third line of the above verse reproduced in the excellent Russian edition of the Tibetan Nyāyabindu (by F. J. Sherbatski) seems to be a mistake for \(\square\)

¹ Dharmakīrti was born in Southern India.

Tibetan by the Indian sage Jinamitra and the interpreter of Shu-

chen named Vande-ye-ses-sde.

13. Nyayubındutikā (Tib.: Rigs pahi-thigs-pahi-rgya-cherhgrel-wa) - "a detailed explanation of Nyāvabindu (No 11)" by Dharmottara (Tib.: Chos-inchog). It extends over 63 deaves (leaf 43-106) of the Tangyur, mdo, she, and begins with an invocation to Manju-ś ri-kumārabhūta. It was translated into Tibetan first by the Indian sage Jñānavarbha and the interpreter of Shu-chen named Gelong Dharmāloka, and afterwards neatly by the Indian sage Sumati-kirti and the Tibetan interpreter Gelong Blo-Idan-seg-rab, who obtained a copy of the work from the Middle Country (that is, Magadha).

14. Nyñyabindu-pūrvapakse-samksipta (Tib.: Rigs-pahithigs pali-phyogs-sna-ma-mdor-bsdus-pa)-a summary of the objections to (or criticisms on) Nyavabindu, by Kamala-sila of wide fame. It extends over nine leaves (leaf 106-115) of the Tangyur, mdo, she, and begins with an obeisance to the Supreme Blessed one. It was translated into Tibetan by the Indian sage Viśuddha-sin and the interpreter of Shu-chen named Gelong Dpal-

rtsegs-raksita.

15. Ny "yabindu-vindārtha 2 (Tib. : Rigs-pahi-thigs-pahi-donbsdus-pa)—"the purport of Nyāvabindu" by Jinamitra. It consists of one leaf only (leaf 115—116) of the Tangyur, mdo, she, and begins with an invocation to Mañju-śrī-kumārabhūta. It was translated into Tibetan by the Indian Teacher Surendrabodhi and the interpreter of Shu chen named Vande-ye-ses-sde.

10. Hetubindu-nāma-prakaruna (Tib.: Gtan-tshigs-kyi-thigs-pa-shes-bya-wahi-rab-tu-byed-pa)—"a treatise on a drop of reason" by reason" by Dharmakirti. It extends over 20 leaves (leaf 355-375) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, and begins with an invocation to Buddha. The three chapters, into which it is divided, treat respectively of the following:—(1) svabhāva, Tib.: ran-bshingyi-gtau-ishig-kyi skabs, or the relation of identity between the reason (that is, middle term) and the major term; (2) karya, Tib.: hbras-buhi gtan-tshigs, or the relation of effect and cause between the middle term and the major term; and (3) anupalabdhi, Tib.: mi-dmigs-pahi-gtan-tshigs, or the relation of nonperception between the middle term and the (heterogeneous)

17. Hetubindu-tikā (Tib.: Gtan-tshigs-kyi-thigs pa-rgya-cherhgrel-wa)—"a detailed explanation of Hetubindu" by Vinita-

¹ The Tibetan version of Nyāyabinduṭikā by Dharmottara, together with the Nyayabindu by Dharmakirii has been edited by F. J Sherbatski and published in the St. Petersburg Bibliotheca Buddhica series, 1904.

The Sanskrit version of the Nyayabindatika by Dharmottara, together with Nyayabindu, was edited by Prof. P. Peterson and published in the Bib-

liotheca Indica series, Calcutta, 1899

2 The original reading is: "Nyāyabindu-paṇḍirīthā," which may also be restored as "Nyāyabindu-piṇḍārtha," The meaning, according to the Tibetan version, is:-"the abridged meaning of Nyāyabindu."

Vol. III, No. 2.] Indian Logic as preserved in Tibet.
[N.S.]

deva (Tib.: Dul-wahi-lha). It extends over 89 leaves (leaf 116—205) of the Tangyur, indo, she, and begins with an invocation to Buddha. It is divided into three chapters, corresponding to those of the original No. 16. It was translated into Tibetan by the Indian teacher Prajūā-varma and the interpreter of Shu-

chen named Gelong Dpal-brtsegs-raksita.

18. Hetubindu-vivarana (Tib.: Gtan tshigs-thigs-pahi-hgrel-wa)—"an exposition of the Hetubindu" by the Brahman Acita. It extends over 170 leaves (leaf 205—375) of the Tangyur, mdo, she, and begins with an invocation to Bhagavān Vajradhara (Tib: Ecom-Idan-hdas-rdo-rje-hchan-wa). It is divided into four chapters treating respectively of:—(1) svabhāva, Tib: ran-bshin, or relation of identity; (2) kārya, Tib: hbras-bu, or relation of effect and cause; (3) anupalabdhi, Tib: mi-dmigs-pa, or relation of non-perception; and (4) Sad-lakṣaṇa-vyākhyā, Tib: mtshan-ñid drug-hśad-pa, or explanation of six characteristics. The work concludes thus: "In the city of Kāśmīra, the pith of Jambudvīpa, the commentary of Dharma-kīrti who was the best of sages, was translated. From this translation of Pramāṇa, the pith of holy doctrines, let the unlearned derive wisdom." 2

19. Tarku-nyāya-nāma-prakaraṇa ³ (Tib.: Rtsod-paḥi-rigṣ-pa-sheṣ-bya-wa-rub-tu-byed pa)—"a treatise on logical disputation" by Dharmakīrti. It extends over 32 leaves (leaf 384—416) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, and begins with an invocation to Maūju-vajra (Tib: Hjam-paḥi-rdo-rje). It was translated into Tibetan first by the great Indian sage Jūāna-śri-bhadra ¹ and the Tibetan interpreter Gelong Dge-waḥi-blo-gros. Subsequently, the translation was retouched by the great Paṇḍita Dīpaṅkara and the interpreter Gelong Dar-ma-grags.

20. Alumabuna-parikṣā b (Tib.: Dmigs-pa-brtag-pa)—"an examination of the objects of thought" in verse by Dignāga. It consists of one leaf only (leaf 180) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, and begins with an invocation to Buddha and all Bodhisa tvas.

1 Written variously as " Acita," " Atsata" and " Atsata."

(Tangyur, \underline{m} do, she, leaf 375(a)).

4 For bhadra the original reads: badha. Probaby same as No. 1173 (Bunyio Nanjio).

Alambana = Arambana.

³ The original reads: Tsota for Tarka. The Tibetan equivalent is rtsod-pa, meaning "disputation"

21. Ālambana-parīkṣā-vṛtti (Tib.: Dmigs-pa-brtag-pahihgrel)—a "commentary on Alambana-parīkṣā (No. 20)," by Dignāga himself. The work consists of two leaves only (leaf 180-152) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce.

22. Trikāla-parīkṣā (Tib.: Dus-gsum-brtag-pa)—"an examination of three times" by Dignāga. It consists of one leaf (leaf 182a-183b) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, and was translated into Tibetan by the great Pandita Santakara-gupta and the interpreter Gelong Tshul-khrims-rgyal mtshan.

Santānāntara-sidāhi (Tib: Rgyud-gshan-grub-pa)— "establishment of the continuity of succession (of momentary ideas)" by Dharmakirti. It consists of four leaves (leaf 416-420) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, and begins with an invocation to

Mañju-śri-kumārabhūta.

24. Sambandhaparikṣā-prakaraṇa (Tib.: Hbrel-wa-brtagpahi-rab tu-byed-pa)-"a treatise on connection (of the senseorgans with the objects of sense)" by Dharmakirti. It consists of two leaves only (leaf 375b-377a) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, and begins with an invocation to Manju-śri-Kuma abhūta. It was translated into Tibetan by the Indian teacher Jnanagarbha and the interpreter Vande-nam-mkhas.

Sambandhaparīksā-vrtti (Tib.: Hgrel-wa-brtag-pahihgrel-wa)—" a commentary on Sambandhaparikṣā (No. 24)" by Dharmakirti. It extends over seven leaves (leaf 377a-384a) of the Tangyur, mdo, ce, and begins with an invocation to Mañju-

ghosa.

